



# Staff Report

## Community Services

---

**Report To:** Council  
**Meeting Date:** October 3, 2016  
**Report Number:** CSPW.16.135  
**Subject:** Award of Tender 2016-39-T-COM Roof Replacement L.E. Shore Memorial Library  
**Prepared by:** Aaron McMullen, Facility Manager/Building Maintenance Coordinator  
Ryan Gibbons, Manager of Harbour/Cemetery/Building Maintenance Coordinator  
On behalf of the Tender/Proposal Award Committee

---

### A. Recommendations

---

**THAT** Council receive Staff Report CSPW.16.135 entitled "Award of Tender 2016-39-T-COM Roof Replacement L.E. Shore Memorial Library";

**AND THAT** Council approve increasing the Roof Replacement budget of \$150,000 by \$19,500 to \$169,500;

**AND THAT** Council approve the award of Tender 2016-39-T-COM Roof Replacement L.E. Shore Memorial Library to North East Roofing Inc. in the amount of 169,500, excluding HST;

**AND THAT** Council approve reallocating the funding for the Town Hall Accessible Door Openers of \$25,000, Live Snow Fencing of \$34,000, Library Window Replacement of \$30,500 and the Dasher-board Replacement of \$80,000 to the Library Roof Replacement project;

**AND THAT** the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to execute the contract for the Roof Replacement at the L.E. Shore Memorial Library with North East Roofing Inc.

### B. Overview

---

This report outlines the results of the Tendering process for the Roof Replacement at the L.E. Shore Memorial Library and the accompanying Staff award recommendations.

### C. Background

---

In late March of 2016, Municipal Staff began providing Facility Maintenance for the L.E. Shore Memorial Library. After reviewing a health and safety inspection and undertaking discussions with Library Staff, Facility Maintenance Staff deemed the air quality concerns to be of the

highest priority and began the process of determining the appropriate steps required to rectify the concerns.

As directed by Council, Staff hired C. C. Tatham & Associates through negotiation to prepare tender documents and drawings, attend a mandatory site visit and manage the project through the construction phase. The cost of these services is \$21,800 exclusive of HST and including a \$2,000 contingency.

Air Quality sampling was originally performed April 10, 2016 by Breathing Easy, an environmental analysis company that specializes in indoor air quality testing. The results were received May 23. This air quality sampling was a thorough assessment of the entire Library facility. This identified areas to monitor: around the “reading tower”, staff area, and the CEO’s office. One of the recommendations from Breathing Easy was to install an air purifier with true HEPA (High-efficiency particulate arrestance) filtration as a precautionary measure only. Another air quality test was performed July 25, after the organics were removed from the roof and the air purifier was installed. This sampling was focused on the “reading tower”, staff area and the CEO’s office. The results showed a slight improvement. A 3<sup>rd</sup> sampling was completed September 19 identifying improvements in all areas with the “reading tower” area being the exception. This area had slightly higher levels of total spores. The elevated total spores do not exceed acceptable levels within the industry.

#### **D. Analysis**

---

On September 14, 2016 the Town issued a Tender for the roof replacement at the L.E. Shore Memorial Library with a closing date of September 29, 2016. On September 20, 2016 a mandatory site visit was completed with 9 contracting companies in attendance. Upon the completion of the mandatory site visit, 2 addenda were issued.

Two bid submissions were received by the Manager of Purchasing and Risk Management prior to the closing date. Town Staff received the Tender Report prepared by C.C. Tatham on September 30, 2016 (refer to Attachment 1).

<b>No.</b>	<b>Bidders Name</b>	<b>Tender Amount</b>
1	Nedlaw Roofing Ltd.	\$ 178,900.00
2	Northeast Roofing Inc.	\$ 169,500.00

#### **E. The Blue Mountains’ Strategic Plan**

---

Goal #1 - Create opportunities for sustainability

Goal #2 - Engage our communities and partners

Goal #5 - Ensure that our infrastructure is sustainable

## F. Environmental Impacts

---

All effort will be made to ensure that the work completed is performed using best practices for protection of the environment. HEPA air filtration will be used within the containment area for the air quality investigation and remediation.

## G. Financial Impact

---

In Staff Report CSPW.16.106 entitled "Public Library Roof Repairs", Staff outlined the estimated costs to replace the roof and perform any remediation work. At the time, the roof repairs were estimated to cost \$150,000 (including a \$25,000 contingency), \$120,000 for remediation and \$30,000 for engineering for a project total of \$300,000.

Now that the roof replacement costs are known, Staff have included how this portion of the project will be funded. The roof contract came in at \$169,500 including a \$15,000 contingency. Funding for these costs will come for a number of sources outlined below:

<b>Project</b>	<b>Explanation</b>	<b>Funding Available</b>
Town Hall Accessible Doors	Town received a Federal grant for this project	\$25,000
Live Snow Fencing	Project was cancelled due to lack of staffing resources	\$34,000
BVCC Dasher-boards	Project came in under-budget	\$80,000
Library Window Replacement	Project has been delayed until the roof replacement is complete	\$30,500
<b>Total</b>		<b>\$169,500</b>

Once the remediation is complete and final costs are known for that portion of the project, Staff will bring back a report outlining funding options for those costs.

## H. In consultation with

---

Shawn Everitt, Director of Community Services

Serena Wilgress, Manager of Purchasing and Risk Management

Sam Dinsmore, Deputy Treasurer / Manager of Accounting and Budgets

**I. Attached**

---

1. Contract No. 2016-38-T-COM L.E. Shore Library Roof Replacement Report of Tenders

Respectfully submitted,

---

Aaron McMullen  
Facility Manager/Building Maintenance Coordinator

---

Ryan Gibbons  
Manager of Harbour/Cemetery/  
Building Maintenance Coordinator

Approved by:

---

Troy Speck  
Chief Administrative Officer

---

Ruth Prince  
Director of Finance and IT  
Services

---

Serena Wilgress  
Manager of Purchasing and  
Risk Management

For more information, please contact:

Aaron McMullen

[amcmullen@thebluemountains.ca](mailto:amcmullen@thebluemountains.ca)

519-599-3131 extension 340



**C.C. Tatham & Associates Ltd.**  
Consulting Engineers

Collingwood

Bracebridge

Orillia

Barrie

115 Sandford Fleming Drive, Suite 200

Collingwood, Ontario L9Y 5A6

Tel: (705) 444-2565

Fax: (705) 444-2327

Email: info@cctatham.com

Web: www.cctatham.com

**CSPW.16.135  
ATTACHMENT 1**

September 30, 2016

via email (swilgress@thebluemoorains.ca) & mail  
CCTA File 116195-1

**Serena Wilgress**

Manager of Purchasing and Risk Management

Town of The Blue Mountains

32 Mill Street, P.O. Box 310

Thornbury, Ontario N0H 2P0

**Re: Contract No. 2016-39-T-COM – L.E. Shore Library Roof Replacement  
Report on Tenders**

Dear Ms. Wilgress:

We are pleased to present our Report on Tenders for the L.E. Shore Library Roof Replacement.

**Tenders Posting**

The call for tenders was advertised publicly on the Town's website on Wednesday, September 14, 2016. The advertised closing time was 2:00 p.m. on Thursday, September 29, 2016 providing a two-week tender period.

**Time for Completion**

Tenderers were informed in the Tender Documents that work is to commence within five working days of issuing the Start Work Order, which is expected to be issued around October 12, 2016. The date for Substantial Performance is November 18, 2016. The Tender Documents stipulate liquidated damages in the amount of \$500 per day should the completion dates not be met.

**Plan Takers List**

A mandatory pre-bid meeting was held at the library on September 20, 2016. It was attended by eight contractors and one supplier. This being a mandatory meeting, the attendees became the registered bidders.

## **Tender Addenda**

Two addenda were issued during the tender period to respond to questions received during the bidders meeting, and to clarify a detail of the specifications.

## **Tender Opening**

Tenders were received at the Town's office up to 2:00 pm on September 29, 2016. Tenders were opened publicly and details read aloud immediately following the Official Closing Time.

## **Tender Results**

Two bids were received by the Town's Procurement Department. The Town's Procurement Department checked each tender to verify compliance with bid requirements and both were found to be compliant. Copies of the tender submissions were provided to CCTA for review and comment. The submitted tender prices in ascending order, excluding HST, are provided in Table 1 below.

**Table 1: Summary of Tender Prices Received**

<b>Rank</b>	<b>Contractor</b>	<b>Tender Price</b>
1.	Northwest Roofing Inc.	\$169,500.00
2.	Nedlaw Roofing Ltd.	\$178,900.00

Northwest Roofing Inc. was the low bidder with a tender price of \$169,500.00. Tender prices were checked for mathematical errors and none were found. Their bid includes the testing and contingency allowances in the amount of \$20,000.00. The tenders are valid for a 60-day period, ending on November 28, 2016.

## **Low Tenderer's Experience & Ability**

We phoned the three references provided by Northwest Roofing and spoke with two of them. Both references we spoke to provided positive comments and indicated they were satisfied with the work completed by Northwest Roofing Inc. The projects they referenced on the experience summary were of a similar magnitude to this roofing replacement project.

## **Approvals**

No outside approvals are required. We understand staff in the facilities department at the Town have submitted an application for a building permit.

## Recommendation

Of the two eligible tenders received, Northwest Roofing Inc. provided the lowest tender price. Based on their recent project experience and positive references, we believe Northwest Roofing Inc. possesses sufficient experience and competence to carry out a contract of this size and scope.

On the basis of our review of the Tenders, we recommend the contract for the L.E. Shore Library Roof Replacement (Tender No. 113069-1) be awarded to Northwest Roofing Inc. in the amount of \$169,500.00 (excluding HST).

We trust this Report on Tenders meets your requirements. Should you require any further information or clarification, please do not hesitate to call.

Yours truly,

**C.C. Tatham & Associates Ltd.**



Michael Sanfilippo, B.Sc.Eng, M.PI, P.Eng  
Senior Engineer, Project Manager  
MAS:jb

I:\2016 Projects\116195 - L.E. Shore Library ROof Replacement\Documents\Letters\L - Wilgress001 - Report on Tenders.doc