

STAFF REPORT: ENGINEERING AND PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT



REPORT TO: Infrastructure & Recreation Committee
MEETING DATE: May 26, 2009
REPORT NO.: EPW.09.044
SUBJECT: Environmental Assessment and
 Preliminary Design of the Access to the
 Community of Slabtown – Consultant
 Selection

PREPARED BY: Reg Russwurm – Director of Engineering
 and Public Works

A. Recommendation

THAT Council approve retaining C.C. Tatham & Associates Ltd. to provide engineering services for the Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design of the Access to the Community of Slabtown in the amount of \$103,950 consisting of \$98,950 upset fee estimate plus \$5,000 fee contingency as outlined in Report EPW.09.044 “Environmental Assessment and Preliminary Design of the Access to the Community of Slabtown – Consultant Selection”,

THAT Council approve increasing the 2009 Capital Budget for engineering services and studies for the Slabtown Bridge by \$30,000 from \$95,000 to \$125,000, and

THAT Council to authorize the Mayor and Clerk to execute the Engineering Agreement for this assignment.

B. Background

The Slabtown Bridge in the Town of The Blue Mountains spans the Beaver River and is the only access into the Slabtown community. It was built in 1930 as a single lane Half-Through Truss, sometimes referred to as a Pony Truss, and has a single span of 28.4 metres with a width of 4.9 metres. The bridge is currently posted with a load limit of 9 tonnes and has been identified for immediate improvement in the Town’s Bridge Needs Study.

The Town wishes to undertake a Schedule “C” Class Environmental Assessment (EA) in accordance with the Municipal Engineer Association’s (MEA) Class EA process for improved access to Slabtown Road and the Community. The scope of work for this project includes satisfying Phases 1 to 4 of the Class EA process and is to culminate in the submission of a Preliminary Design Report for the Preferred Option. Options which will be considered are, but not necessarily limited to, the following:

1. Do Nothing,
2. Rehabilitate the existing bridge,
3. Replace the existing bridge,
4. Construct a new road from County Road 13 to Slabtown Road
5. Construct a new road from County Road 40 to Slabtown Road
6. Other options or combination of options arising during the Environmental Assessment

The need for a secondary access to the community must be considered particularly as it relates to emergency vehicle access and suitability of improvements to the existing bridge. The provision of a second access may reduce / eliminate the need for bridge improvements as it relates to deck width and loading.

Given the history of the area as a mill site - perhaps even use by first nations - and the age of the bridge, one of the tasks of the study will be to conduct an archaeological, social and cultural heritage assessment of the study area. An archaeological site was registered in 1987 within the study area, Borden N^o BD HC 17. A Stage 1 Archaeological Assessment will be undertaken in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act and filed with the Ministry of Culture. Similarly, the age of the bridge requires a Cultural Heritage Assessment as per the Ontario Heritage Bridge Guidelines.

Depending on the findings of the archaeological and heritage assessments, and other preliminary investigations, additional studies may be necessary such as a Stage 2 archaeological assessment, specialised structural study and/or geotechnical investigations. Staff will retain those services in accordance with the Town's Purchasing Policies. Staff recommend that approximately \$20,000 be allocated in the project budget for this additional work.

The project will conclude with the Consultant preparing a Preliminary Design Report to outline the work to be completed during Final Design and Contract Administration and the expected costs. The Town will undertake a separate Consultant Selection process to undertake the final design and construction activities for the preferred design alternative.

The project will include, but will not be limited to, the following major tasks:

- Task 1: Collect and Review Background Information
- Task 2: EA Phase 1 - Identify the Problem or Opportunity
- Task 3: EA Phase 2 - Identify and Evaluate Alternative Solutions
- Task 4: EA Phase 3 - Identify and Evaluate Alternative Design Concepts
- Task 5: EA Phase 4 - Prepare Environmental Study Report
- Task 6: Prepare Preliminary Design Report

After the completion of Phase 2 of the EA Process, a key decision will be whether or not to proceed with Phase 3 & 4 of the EA Process. That decision is based on the estimated cost of the work (over \$2.2M requires Phases 3 & 4) and the discretion of the Town depending on the public reception to the proposed works. A planned presentation to the Infrastructure and Recreation Committee at the conclusion of Phase 2 of the EA will recommend whether or not to continue with the EA process or move to the preparation of the Preliminary Design Report.

Consultant Selection:

The Town prepared a Request for Proposal and issued it on April 8, 2009. The Consultant selection was a single step process. Proposals consisting of Detailed Work Plans and Upset Fee Estimates in separate sealed envelopes were received from nine consultants.

The Consultant Selection Team, consisting of Reg Russwurm, Jim McCannell, Tom Gray, and Sherri Adams satisfied themselves that the proposals were complete.

Consultants were evaluated based on the following weighted evaluation factors:

<u>Quality Factors</u>	
Firm's Qualifications and Experience on Similar Projects	10%
Project Team's Experience	20%
Project Understanding and Approach	15%
Work Plan, Methodology and Quality Assurance Plan	20%
Project Schedule	10%
<u>Fee Factor</u>	25%
Total	100%

The Consultant achieving the highest combined weighted quality and fee factors was C.C. Tatham & Associates Limited and therefore the Selection Team recommends retaining this firm in the amount of \$103,950 consisting of \$98,950.00 upset fee estimate plus \$5,000.00 fee contingency.

C. The Blue Mountains' Strategic Plan

Town's Strategic Plan Goal # 2 "Addressing the Town's Municipal Infrastructure needs" is in part satisfied by the recommended action.

D. Budget Impact

The 2009 Capital Budget provides \$65,000 for engineering services and \$30,000 for studies giving a total of \$95,000. Staff recommends increasing the combined 2009 Capital Budget for engineering services and studies for the Slabtown Bridge by \$30,000 from \$95,000 to \$125,000. This will facilitate adequate funding for the core engineering services and approximately \$21,000 to undertake specialised studies and investigations. The increase in engineering services and studies costs will be paid from Capital Reserves or Taxation as determined by the Town's Capital Accountant. The 2010 Capital Budget will reflect the estimated project costs to be prepared under this consulting assignment.

The Upset Fee Estimate from CC. Tatham & Associates Limited is summarised in the table below:

Background Information	\$3,875
EA Phase 1 & 2 (Class B)	\$47,187
EA Phase 3 & 4 (Class C)	\$24,500
Preliminary Design Report	\$23,388
Sub-Total	\$98,950
Fee Contingency	\$5,000
Grand Total	\$103,950

The costs associated with EA Phase's 3 & 4 (\$24,500) may be avoided if the project is considered to meet the requirements of a Class B EA project and the Town feels continuing with a more in-depth EA review is not warranted.

E. Attached

1. Figure 1 - Location Map: Slabtown Road and Area

Respectfully submitted,

Reg Russwurm
Director, Engineering and Public Works

**FIGURE 1:
SLABTOWN ROAD AND AREA**

